

***AN APPLICATION TO THE GOOD GOVERNANCE WITHIN URBAN  
POLICY FORMULATION IN MANADO CITY GOVERNMENT  
NORTH SULAWESI-INDONESIA***

---

**G.S.V. Lumentut(\*), Paula Runtuwene(\*\*), Hendrik Warokka(\*\*\*)**

(\*) Jl. Balai Kota No. 1 Tikala  
Manado 95124  
Indonesia  
[gsv\\_lumentut@yahoo.com](mailto:gsv_lumentut@yahoo.com)

(\*\*) Jl. Kampus UNIMA Tonsaru  
Tondano 95618  
Indonesia  
[julyetapar@yahoo.com](mailto:julyetapar@yahoo.com)

(\*\*\*) Jl. 5 September II No. 40 Malalayang I  
Manado 95262  
Indonesia  
[Hwarokka@yahoo.com](mailto:Hwarokka@yahoo.com)

---

**Abstract**

In the spirit of autonomy region, the good governance needs to be applied in Manado city government and in this research focuses on the involvement of three prime actors those are state or local government, civil society, and private sector in urban policy formulation. The research findings, there are interaction among the actors who haven't been constructively built yet in term of equally, participative, efficient, and accountable.

The synergy interaction mechanism of local government, civil society, and private sector are a creation value in the policy formulation process.

**Keywords:** Autonomy region; good governance; policy formulation

**Résumé**

Cet article traite d'une Recherche conduite dans la ville de Manado et vise à apprécier, l'implication de catégories d'acteurs (collectivités locales, société civile, secteur privé) dans la formulation d'une politique de développement urbain, les interactions existantes.

**Mots-clé:** acteur; autonomie; projet; interaction; urbain.

# ***AN APPLICATION TO THE GOOD GOVERNANCE WITHIN URBAN POLICY FORMULATION IN MANADO CITY GOVERNMENT NORTH SULAWESI-INDONESIA***

## **Introduction**

The governmental performance remained the main focal point in central government during 32 years in new order regime instead of in region. Government's authority was centralized in the capital city of Indonesia, Jakarta. It was not in province, region, or municipality. In decision making the first priority was state interest with ignorance the society interest. The centralization system has certainly been depended the regional leaders to central government. It has become their compliance directly only to state leaders rather than to their community. This awfully situation had made the new order regime succeeded to reduce the community opportunity in giving their openly ideas to the existing governmental institution.

As it used to happen to top-down manner that it has done by central government, for instance the project plan or the program planning consider eradicating the creativities at municipality. Because all the programs or projects have designed at center level and municipality level are only instantly as executor. For that reason, in the city level becomes very necessary to arrange the own development policy. This moving role will progressively encourage the city to more innovative and creative to design the city's development program. The city development will be focused to each city's vision and mission. In order that, the development acceleration will be appropriate with their vision and mission and it is not anymore the vision and mission of central government that it is mostly irrelevant with the fact on each area to be implemented.

On the other hand, globalization era has disclosure some inter-relevant among the states. It has almost no state in this world that is free from the influence of others state. Globalization has given an opportunity to create a collectively agreement to manage the government with global commitment. By the global commitment, it has turned up to the new world order that has been agreed by European

Union and United States of America. It is as a foundation to manage the government particularly on the aspects of good governance and public accountability.

Theoretically, there are three important components which are closely related to each other in building good governance.

- First, State has taken an important role, especially to set up the strongly foundation for fairness, equity, peaceful, and to improve the conducive climate of law and politic for development.
- Second, Civil Society has taken an important role in building a foundation for freedom, equality, and self-actualization in such a way of responsibility.
- Third, Private sector is very important to set up a foundation for economic growth and development. Private sector might have created the revenue and might have increased the production volume. It can also create an opportunity to work and increase the revenue, trade and human resources, etc.

Good governance is not only important to the nation existence for prosperity and righteousness but also the importance is the implementation of good governance till to lower level of society. When the state's powerful authority is only decentralized to regional level. It means that the meaning of good governance is narrowed. Absolutely the decentralization concept is not only related to delegation transfer of administrative but also it transfers the authority.

Thorough good governance will be found the entity or the characteristic of political life such as participation, strategic

vision, rule of law, transparency, responsive, responsibility, effective and efficient. Its characteristic is needed to achieve the decentralization's goal. It is the regional management that it is based on regional context.

Governance approach is more intention on collective action. Government wants to formulate the policy process more participative and democracy. Each actor will be interactive and give mutually inclusive in order to obtain the collective interest.

Based on the description above it shows us that regional policy must be formulated by involving all the interrelated constituents. Moreover the regional regulation as a main principle of regional policy must truly accommodate the community's interest.

## **Statement of the Problems**

In doing this research there are several problems founded through inquiring the process of application of good governance within organization of the governance of Manado. After analyzing, the questions could be formulated as a guideline of this research and could be presented as follows:

1. How is the performance of good governance in policy formulation?
2. Who are they involved and are dominantly influenced in policy formulation?
3. How do all the actor interaction into their involved to formulate the policy?

## **Analytical Framework**

Essentially, the concept of governance describes the changing of governmental meaning as follows: a) a new process of governing; b) a changed condition of ordered rule; c) the new method by which society is governed (Rhodes, 1996; 652-653).

The role of society, it doesn't mean that the society must take part to do the government tasks but to support the governmental activities with gentleness. As a result, the society doesn't directly come in the office to take over government duty but give the aspiration as a positive injection in a view of the policy decision by government. The implication of policy is based on the

determining of community's aspiration it could produce fairness feeling to all the civil society.

Demands could come up when the individuals or group have gotten policy making process from state or region. Its demands might be from political system such as community member, group, stakeholder etc.

Supporting is needed to support the demand that has made. If the political system has succeeded to make a decision or policy that it has been suitable to demands so that the implementation of decision is very easy to do. As the indicators that they have already support the decision it could be seen in term of accepting the decision, compliance the law, paying the tax.

Output of a political system is decisions and authority performances and to assist in organizing the effects that it is flowing from member attitudes system then it applies to their environment (Varma, 1999).

State or region's policy is output of political activities. There is a desire to do or doesn't do anything authoritatively it will be addressed to all the community. Because it is authoritatively, yet the policy could legally be forced to implement to all sub system of the whole political system.

## **Research Methodology**

This research of good governance implementation in urban policy formulation is made by using qualitative naturalistic research and research design is case study. The data collection technique is made by in-dept interview, observation and document. While the using technique in checking the data validation is data triangulation and methodology then having discussion with friends mate and colleagues (Moleong, 2002;178-179).

## **Research Findings and Description: an application to Good Governance Mechanism in Region Policy Formulation**

Implementation of good governance mechanism in region policy formulation in Manado city could be reflected on the formulation process of regional regulation design. It is well known as the basic pattern of regional development of Manado city in 2000-

2005. In formulation the regional regulation of regional revenue and expenditure budget plan 2004 showed that the good governance mechanism hasn't well applied yet. And the stakeholder refused.

In the formulation process of regional regulation design draft of the basic pattern of regional development of Manado city in 2000-2005, Manado city government has done the formulation mechanism by involving the stakeholders for instance; government bureaucracy, city counsel member, non governmental organizations, prominent people in community, expertise in university and private sector.

They could be participated and be interactive during discussion and could constructively formulate the vision and mission of Manado City. This could be heard from the actor of NGOs', official government and private sector statements. Generally, they said that they could sit on round table together to share, to give the ideas, and sometimes argumentation debate to have constructively resulted. Otherwise city counsel would like to express an appreciation to executive particularly the development and planning board over the result of formulation the regional development basic pattern toward the discussion forum process in city counsel level run very smooth. All the actors who engaged in regional policy formulation are expected that the mechanism in formulation of regional development draft could be converted into a model in regional policy formulation in the future. Furthermore the good governance is going to be sooner shaped in Manado city.

It was surely contrary to the fact of formulation process of regional revenue and expenditure budget design draft in 2004. It considered drawing interest each other between executive and legislative. There were two huge agenda that had been detected in formulation process of regional revenue and expenditure design budget draft in 2004, one side there was proposed budget by legislative and another side there was also proposed budget by executive. Unfortunately both of them demonstrated their arrogance.

By the reason the legislative and executive wanted to optimally improve their performance. The legislative compelled to

increase significantly their routine budget. They said that the increasing of facility and salary it based on the average of economic status of the city counsel member is under middle range and fortunately they got mercy of reformation climate to be city counsel member. They might not be confidence when vis-à-vis with the bureaucracy because in their point of view, the legislative has already economically settled. In that case they have interest to rise up their wealthy.

The city counsel member took advantages in the right momentum by the issued of government regulation No. 110 year 2000 regarding the financial position of Regional People's Representative Assembly. It figures out the amount of facilities and representative money that could eligibly be received by chairman and member of city counsel. By the guideline of its government regulation, city counsel member wishes getting a good opportunity to rise up the salary and some facilities to be allocated on regional revenue and expenditure budget design near 2004.

Their effort and demand could be still normative with the assuming that good facility and pleasing salary will be able to perform good job and more optimal in doing its function. One thing coincidence they pursued in such an unpleasant way and ambiguity. It is much better if the civil society might engaged for instance open the public hearing either direct or indirect. And civil society doesn't feel cheating of their regional representative and people's representative can get rid of constituent's distrust as well.

Either executive or legislative were very closed to draft discussion of regional revenue and expenditure budget design year 2004. it looked like top secret all the content of budget and could not be interrupted by anybody else. After executive and legislative have stipulated the content of regional revenue and expenditure budget design year 2004, of course the regional regulation design will be submitted to chairman regional assembly to proceed process.

Discussion on inclusive meeting if basically only formality to fulfill the formal constitution requirement but often it something could be unpredictable to be happened in the

meeting progress. Its surprises are embarrassing even if it is out of the agreement scenario. Accordance with the experience and observation research, it almost never happens because the substantial things have already been discussed and agreed on at the meeting of a budget team and there is also an internal agreement between the chairman of the city council and the mayor.

The atmosphere of sluggish or smooth wind meeting is very contradictory with the situation at the city council's building that is strictly controlled by police. There were demonstrations by students to appeal for a revision of the regional revenue and expenditure budget. The students argued to involve the stakeholders in the discussion of budgeting. The result of the budget was rejected by the community, represented by NGOs and students. It means there was a problem in the relationship and communication between actors in the decision-making process of policy formulation. The role of regional government and city council are still too much and it considers ignoring other actors as well.

The act of regional government attracted the sharp criticism of NGOs or businessmen. Basically, they asked about the act of regional government to whom it didn't open. It was so contradicted to the reformation climate and good governance mechanism that have been seriously implemented. Its regional government policy gave only an impression that the region must pursue the increasing of regional original revenue without thinking of the condition of society's economy that is currently going down.

In the process of regional policy formulation, it takes a long way to go on, particularly in line with the draft of regional regulation design. Moreover, in the process of discussion in the city council forum is too short for the next discussion. When it compares with the result of achievement and the cost to be spent over an entire discussion process, it doesn't significantly show a good progress. Ironically, the huge money spent is still added with "invisible money" as slithering or "polish money" for the city council member. It has been provided by governmental leaders or technical units that have submitted the budget proposal to be approved by the legislature. We

found that the money "string of care" is generally taken from non-budgetary technical units. It is from the saving fund of last year's project. These demonstrate that the legislature indirectly agrees or lets the budget be falsified by governmental leaders.

Unhealthy conspiring must be ended soon. It is in order to avoid regional government decaying that finally agitates the implementation of regional autonomy. Good governance is particularly in regional government for policy formulation; it has to be rightly and healthily implemented. Actors from the private sector and civil society must be more empowering and functioning. It is about balancing authority as well as controlling the regional government's performance.

There are two cases above as an interesting example to the righteousness of governance theory with an approach known as socio-cybernetics approach (Rhodes; 1996). The core of this approach is along with community movement and complexity issues which need to be sooner decided, diversity of government institutions and civil society power who participate in the policy-making process that the outcome satisfaction of public policy is impossible to be achieved if it is only managed by the government sector. The effectiveness of public policy of government theory side is an interaction synergy product of diverse actors or institutions (Abdul Wahab; 1999: 5).

The point of view on regional government performance is still rooted with the new order circumstance; it must soon be changed and fitted with a new paradigm of governmental region as carried out by Law Number 32 Year 2004 regarding regional governance. This has given enough space to the legislative institution to be more active in the policy process. In Article 25 are the duties and authorities and in Article 43 are the rights and obligations of the legislature. It explicitly says in its law that the legislature is the regional people's representative assembly and shall be an element to conduct the regional governance. The legislative board has three functions as follows: regulator, budgeting, and controlling. It means to empower the legislators to intensify the control in terms of regional government responsibility to civil society.



Both legislative and executive should work together to accomplish the governmental duties. There are no more important or more dominant each other. They shall be a partnership in many things to equal policy decision process. They need to build up the principles of socio cybernetic system either inside institution or outside environment. And it is also very important to other actors who make the policy. Then the policy process could be more democratic and equality.

The autonomy has given to region it doesn't mean only for executive but it is also for legislative. It supposes that the region could be able to manage and take care itself. In many cases, the regional government leaders and city counsel member have to know how to positioning their-self as policy analyst to do innovatively policy that is much better of policy stakeholder. It needs to do by means to solve the policy problem in unpredictable of escalation level.

It is not easy to do the innovative policy. It has to need an enough skill and knowledge to do power sharing with other policy makers such as civil society and private sector. Sometimes it crashes and conflicts interest among the policy makers and it causes the contra productive.

Consequently, all the regional government leaders and city counsel members ought to build the policy network in policy innovative process either internal or external institution. All that things are to ease the synergetic cooperation and to create more optimal the output and outcome. Cooperation or partnership between policy making and policy stakeholders could be easier created if there is trustworthy and transparency each other or parties.

### **The actors who involved and influenced within regional policy formulation**

The role of regional government and city counsel still strongly dominant remain on the regional policy formulation in Manado city. There is an atmosphere that the other actors or private sector and civil society are not coincidentally engaged because they assume that

others actors might be against the process of discussion and policy formulation. And it is very awful about the invisible or bias agenda from executive and legislative. They are anxious if there are other actors that shall be involved.

More dominant the regional government and city counsel in policy formulation process it has been caused the dissatisfaction would be expressed through demonstrating of NGOs and students. They would come to city counsel's office when to approve the regional revenue and expenditure budget design to be regional revenue and expenditure budget year 2004. They complained because it didn't involve the community in budget plan formulation. According to the students, the content of regional revenue and expenditure budget was only priority the legislative and executive interest instead of community interest.

Along the kinds of policy decision making have done by executive and legislative it is very often the communities' complaining. The policy has made it was only one side and was ignorance the communities' aspiration. It isn't surprisingly of the impulsive policy, of course it was strictly criticized by the society. Everything has happened because both legislative and executive have not been transparent yet to manage the regional policy formulation process. This situation could not be restrained to regional governance in the future.

Nowadays we have to realize that the life of community has made a lot of progress in thinking and performing; for example, increasing the degree of education. It has given the bright thinking of society, executive and legislative will be challenged by the argumentation of intelligent people. Therefore regional government must be more transparent in making regional policy formulation.

Transparent does not mean disclosure or naked but it means that it gives an opportunity to civil society and private sector to take a role in policy formulation process in relation to broad community interest. It is to be done to build the all stakeholders participation and to increase the communities' trustful to regional government institution.

Various policies are arranged by executive and legislative which are related to communities' obligation such as regional taxes and retributions must first be informed to community before approving. By doing that, the particular community as favour taxation subject should give avocation regarding the policy.

The phenomena of demonstration or news polemic are an indication that deliberately the awareness of society has been rising to involve in policy formulation. They were shaped to the object of policy and now they pursue to rise up in getting involved into policy formulation. It is one of the empowerment of civil society. But unfortunately in taking in action NGOs and students are still out of control and sometime it is not constructive. Then the result is not optimal.

### **Interaction of inter-actors who involved in Policy Formulation**

The relationship or interaction inter-actors who involved in policy formulation consist of regional development, city counsel, civil society, non-governmental organizations, and private sector as following explanations:

#### **1. Regional government and Non Governmental Organizations Relation**

Generally, there is suspicious between regional government and non governmental organizations in doing their activities. In particular the NGOs work in the field of politic. It is effected the disaccord relationship. It has happened because certain actors who are on behalf of NGOs to take some advantages for their interest either in economic or political interest. Although the limited dialog has been done by them, for instance regional development basic pattern draft.

Another side bureaucrat is anxious with NGOs. They are worry about the mistaken performances will be exposed and it is very risk to the position. A good relationship has been created between regional government and NGOs in term of social purposes such as social foundations, daycare,

and nursing assistance and education field. Both parties could work well together. The NGOs have taken part to solve the social problem in community.

#### **2. Regional government and private sector relation**

Private sector is still as subordinate over the regional government. They depend on the regional government to the projects, licenses and other facilities. They feel privilege to criticize the bureaucrat even though they know that there is a strangeness to execute the development project plan.

In the development coordinate meeting is one of the ways to involve the participation of private sector in arrangement the regional policy but the private sector is still powerless and it remains as compliment.

#### **3. Local government and Legislative relation**

In transition situation of implementing the regional autonomy has happened crash interest between legislative and regional government.

Because of:

a) new politician is from extremely different environmental thought comparing with old politician who remain as regional government partnership and they have a similarity to figure out the problems. They are also tightening by the same interest. Both of them never have a conflict and always accord in decision and language.

Now everything is very different sometimes it is very light and suddenly could be conflict.

b) new politicians are from pressuring environmental new order regime and was discriminatively behaved and was victim from the violence of political new order. It exactly has done by regional bureaucrat. This is a negative sowing both of them work together.

c) new politician is also "annoyance" or is "annoyed" for 32 years. Psychologically, as a loser colour their attitude to the bureaucrat.

d) bureaucrats side, they are from an environmental educated and are more experienced to manage the regional

government. Consequently, the bureaucrats consider arrogant and ruin the new politician.

e) in the view of new politician, bureaucrats are as “mugger” who could not and would not be trusted. All the things mention above become the relationship between legislative and executive have suspicious each other. It is to be contra productive in performing their functions and duties.

#### **4. Legislative and non governmental organizations relation**

Some of city counsel member are having a notion that the relation both city counsel and non-governmental organizations is fewer harmony because in general NGOs are still feeble in determination the vision and mission of organization. They consider moving in all circumstances of fields consequently they are not really focus to decide the main priority. Some of them work to figure out the negative issues who the bureaucrat and counsel are involved.

Somehow there is a perception that if NGOs involve in discussion of policy formulation it might be contra productive because NGOs presume apriory to legislature's step. Other than there is a positive hope from legislative to build more synergy of a good relationship with NGOs. Both legislative and NGOs have the same goal to effort and to empower the community in decision arrangement.

In another side definitely the NGOs wish for having discussion over the community problems that have not been accumulated yet by legislature. They want to involve in policy formulation so that the output of policy shall be much better and shall be accepted by society.

The relation both legislative and non governmental organizations are fewer harmony and suspicious feeling each other. It could be taken over by both of them to open more constructive dialog and to synergize clearly agenda discussion. This consensus will be created the mutual partnership to citizen favourably.

#### **5. Legislative and private sector relation**

Legislative is associated with private sector just in the level of policy implementation. While in term of policy formulation, the private sector remains directly disengaged. In point of view of private sector actors want to dialog with legislative about the city building and the role of private sector in development. But they are still doubt and having difficulties to access in the legislative area.

#### **6. NGOs and Private Sector Relation**

NGOs are often become “black goat” or insulted to labour problems. Essentially between NGOs and businessman have to synergize to be more empowerment the employee to avoid the conflicts.

NGOs are not only empowerment the labour but they are also empowerment the company owner to understand the obligation to his labour. He might be changed the paradigm that it is from labour as production instrument to be a partner work and in whole is to be his prestigious company asset which need to be protected.

If the relation between NGOs and private sector are in harmony it shall give a good contribution to be implementing the regional policy in urban development.

### **Conclusion and Recommendation**

#### **1. Conclusion**

Based on the research findings and on the spot observation is about an application to good governance within regional policy formulation which it is focusing on formulation process the regional policy design in Manado city and is continued to comprehend the result of research findings therefore it could be draw the some conclusions as follows:

1. It is juridical constraint to civil society and private sector or actors to involve inside of regional government role in regarding with policy formulation. In the formal provision and the code of conduct of legislative might not have to involve the civil society and private sector to formulate and to endorse the regional regulation. The participation



awareness of society is exactly growth in policy formulation. It appears from critic reactions to be spoken by NGOs, students and civil society to legislative who doesn't involve them to policy formulation.

2. There are three important factors which are closely related to each others to build good governance those are state or executive and legislative, civil society and private sectors. On regional policy formulation in Manado city, the role of state or regional government and legislative are very dominant. There is an atmosphere that the actors (private sectors and civil society) knowledgably are not involved because there is assumption that they might be the barrier to the formulation process and invisible agenda from executive and legislative. They are worrying about if others actors involve and will be exposed friction things.
3. Executive and legislative is less able to attract the synergies interaction with civil society and private sectors as the need of good governance. Consequently, the negative reactions of community could be caused the distraction of policy implementation and the less objective achievement target.
4. The theory implication of this research assurances and support the concept of good governance application on main public sector to formulate the policy. It should be done by democratic, decentralization, inclusive, participative, transparent, efficiency, and accountable.

## 2. Recommendation

1. It is need to be managed the regional regulation or code of conduct the legislative of having to involve the stakeholder in regional policy formulation. Then there has no reason

from executive and legislative to avoid a wrongful in implementing the community's trustful of regional policy.

2. In regional policy formulation must consider to the principles of the community interest and private sector. For that reason, there are three main actors in good governance have the same access to determine the policy for together interest. There has no one actor more dominant then others.
3. The relation among the main actors are more established toward more synergy either executive, legislative, civil society, or private sector. If the relation of three actors are in accord it will be implicated to regional policy formulation process that is more democratic, decentralization, inclusive, participative, transparent, efficient and accountable.
4. To activate the role of civil society and private sector in Manado city in regional policy formulation, the method bottom up must be utilized.
5. The capability of NGOs is in civil society empowerment to the future it needs to be increased because there is still weakness in the internal organization's vision, paradigm and the human resources.
6. Need to empowerment the private sector actors to increase the participation and partnership. They need the openness from regional government and legislative and need to extremely step in reducing the regulation and simplicity procedure that are restraint their creativities. Private sector has more give opportunity to take a role in policy formulation process, implementing, and development controlling.

## Reference:

- Bankstown Council. 1996, *City Plan 2000*, Local Government, Bankstown Australia.
- Bhatta, Ghambir. 1996, "Capacity Building at the Local Level for Effective Governance; Empowerment Without Capacity is Meaningless", Paper presented in the International Conference on Governance Innovation: Building the Government-Citizen Business Partnership, October 20-23, Manila, Philippines.
- Bryson, J. 1988 *Strategic Planning for Public and Nonprofit Organization*, Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
- Corbett, D. 1996. *Australian Public Sector Management*, Allen & Unwin, Sydney
- Chermayeff, S. and Tzonis, A. 1971 *Shape of Community: Realization of Human Potential*, Penguin Books Ltd, England.
- Donald, A. 1979 *Introduction to Research in Education*, Holt, Rinehart and Winston Inc., New York.
- Forster, J. and Browne, M. 1996 *Principle of Strategic Management*, Macmillan, Melbourne.
- Haeruman, H. 1999 *Penataan Ruang dalam Era Otonomi Daerah yang Diperluas*, article, Bulletin, Bappenas Indonesia.
- Hallam, R. 1994 *Minister's Review: Local Government in 1994, Its Coming Together*, Minister for Local Government, Victoria.
- Hikam, Mohammad AS., 1999 *Demokratisasi dan Civil Society*, Pustaka LP3ES, Jakarta.
- Hornby, AS. 1998 *Oxford Learner's Dictionary*, Oxford University Press, London
- Indonesian Government. 1999 *State Law of RI No. 22 year 1999 Re The Local Government (1999) Government Decree*, Republic of Indonesia.
- Johnston, J. 1997 'Managing Strategically' in Dollery, B. and Marshall, N. (eds) *Australian Local Government: Reform and Renewal*, Macmillan, Melbourne.
- Jess, S. 1980 *The Random House College Dictionary Revised Edition*, Random House Inc., USA.
- Koteen, J. 1997 *Strategic Management in Public and Nonprofit Organizations*, Preager, Westport.
- Longman, N. 1987 *Dictionary of Contemporary English New Edition*, Clays Ltd, London.
- McKenna, B. 1995 *Community Participation in Local Government*, Australian Center for Local Government Studies, University of Canberra.
- Moleong, Lexy J., 2002 *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*, Remaja Rosdakarya, Bandung.
- Mintzberg, H. 1994 *The Rise and Fall of Strategic Planning*, Free Press, New York.
- Paquet, Gilles, 1994 "Paradigm of Governance" in Canadian Centre for Management Development, Rethinking Government, The Dewar Series: Perspective on public Management, of Supply and Service Canada, Canada.
- Pinto, Regerio F., 1994 *Projecting the Government Approach to Civil Service Reform: An Institutional Environment Assessment for Preparing a Sectoral Adjustment Loans at the Gambia*, World Bank Discussion Paper No.252, Africa Technical Department Series, World Bank, Washington DC.
- Rhodes, RAW, 1996 *The New Governance: Governing without Government*, *Political Studies*, XLIV, 652-667.

Sutherland Shire Council. 1999 *Our Shire-Our Future: Our Guide for Shaping the Shire to 2030* (draft)

Soegijoko, Budi Tjahyati S. 1999 *Kebijaksanaan Nasional Perkotaan Dalam Memasuki Milenium Ketiga*, Article, Bulletin Perdana, Bappenas Indonesia.

UNDP, 1996 *Process Consultation Systemic Improvement of Public Sector Management*", presented building the governance innovation: Building the Government-Citizen, Business Partnership, October 20-23, Manila, Philippines.

Varma, SP. 1998 *Teori Politik Modern*, Rajagrafindo Persada, Jakarta.

Viljoen, J. 1994 *Strategic Management*, Longman, Sydney.

Wensing, E. 1997 *The Process of Local Government Reform: Legislative Change in The States* in Dollery, B. and Marshall, N. (eds) *Australian Local Government: Reform and Renewal*, Macmillan, Melbourne.

World Bank 2000 *Rationale for Decentralization, A World Free of Poverty*, Article on World Bank web site, The World Bank Group.

World Bank 2000 *What is Decentralization, A World Bank Free of Poverty*, Article on World Bank web site, The World Bank Group.